

*Thus – Speaks – the Indo-European*  
Reconstructing Direct Speech

Christian Bruns  
Philipps-Universität Marburg  
brunsc@students.uni-marburg.de

November 5, 2022

# Referred Speech

## Coulmas 1986: 2

We can talk about talk. This is true for all natural languages and is, indeed, a fundamental feature whose absence disqualifies any sign system as human language.

# Referred Speech

## Coulmas 1986: 2

We can talk about talk. This is true for all natural languages and is, indeed, a fundamental feature whose absence disqualifies any sign system as human language.

- Referred speech is universal
  - Old languages had referred speech
  - Reconstructed proto-languages should have referred speech

# Parts of Referred Speech

- Main components:
  - 1 Speech Quote Q
  - 2 (**Speech Introduction S**)
  - 3 (Quotative Particle P)

## Example

*Mary said: "I don't like chocolate."*

# Overview of Quotative ‘Particles’

- Hittite: *-wa(r)-*
- Sanskrit: *iti*
  
- Latin: *inquam*
- Ancient Greek: ἤμι

# Greek ἤμι and Latin *inquam*

## Pl. Mil. gl. 178

***Vbi abit conclamo:*** heus quid agis tu ***inquam*** in tegulis?

‘As he jumps away, I shout: “Hey, what are you doing”, I say, “on the roof?”’

- Meaning: ‘to say’
- < Verb of speaking
- Verbal features (agreement)

→ Not old!

## Classical Sanskrit: *iti*

- Obligatory in Classical Sanskrit
- Marks the end of speech quotes

### RV VIII.32.15

*nákir vaktá ná dād íti*

‘No one can say: “He does not give.”’

- Grammaticalisation is traceable in Vedic Sanskrit!
- < Adverbial particle ‘thus’

→ Not old!

# Development of the Vedic Quotative *íti*

## PSQ: RV X.61.12

*íti bravīti vaktārī rārāṇah* | *vásor vasutvá kārávo 'nehāh*

'He speaks thus, while bestowing (gifts) at the speaking: "Through the goodness of the good one, the bards are blameless."

## QPS: RV V.37.1

*yá índrāya sunávāma íty āha*

"Let us press (soma) for Indra", thus he says.'

## Rebracketing of *íti*

$$\begin{array}{lcl} [Q [P S]] & > & [[Q P] S] \\ [S Q] & > & [S [Q P]] \\ [[P S] Q] & > & ??? \end{array}$$



# Hittite *-wa(r)*

## KBo 17.105 Ov. ii 17 – 18

*nu=tta mān DINGIR<sup>MEŠ</sup> kissan punussanzi kī=wa kuit iēsser*  
 ‘If the gods ask you thus: “Why did they do this?”’

- Enclitic particle in the Speech Quote
- Quasi-obligatory in Hittite
  - Less common in Old Hittite & some genres

## KBo 3.7 Rv. iii 27 – 29

*nu sarā nepisi atti=ssi halzāis ammugg=a EGIR-pa anda ēp*  
 ‘He shouted towards heaven to his father “Take me aswell!”’

- < Comparative particle (cf. Ved. *iva*, Hitt. *iwar* ‘like’)
- cf. also Am.-En. *S/he was like*

→ Probably not old!

# Speech Introduction

- Verbs of speaking (thinking)
- Verbs of hearing/perception prefer indirect constructions
  
- Two patterns:
  - 1 S – (O) – V (unmarked)
  - 2 V – S (information structure)
- Optionally: adverbial 'thus'-particle

## V – S Structure

### Klein 1991: 76

There is every reason to believe that fronting of verbs of speaking before a quotation is a feature inherited from Proto-Indo-European.

### Old Persian

*ϑatīy Dārayavauš xšāyavϑiya.*

‘Darius, the king, says.’

### Avestan

*mraot ahurō mazdā spitamāi zaraϑuštrāi.*

‘Ahurā Mazda says to Zarathustra Spitama.’

### Greek II. 1.84 – 1.85

τὸν δ' ἀπαμειβόμενος προσέφη πόδας ὠκὺς Ἀχιλλεύς

‘Then the swift-footed Achilles answered and spoke to him:’

# Adverbial Particles

- Every language uses an adverbial particle in its speech introduction:
  - Hitt. *kissan*
  - Ved. *íti*
  - Gr. ὥς
  - Lat. *ita, sic*
- 'thus'

# Examples of Adverbial Particles

## Od. 21.143

... ὥς ἔφατ' Ἀντίνοος, τοῖσιν δ' ἐπιήνδανε μῦθος.

'... Thus Antinoos spoke and they took pleasure in the speech.'

## Pl. As. 352 – 353

*Sic hoc respondit mihi: ...*

'So he responded this to me: ...'

## KUB 7.60 Ov. iii 11 – 12

*[nu] kisan memai ...*

'Thus he speaks: ...'

# Adverbial Particles

- Phonologically different
- Individually innovated particle
  - Shared function
  - cf. Lexical innovation in formulaic reconstruction
  - Historically: Adverbial derivation of a productive deictic pronoun

# Origin of Adverbial Particles

- PIE \**í-*
  - →Lat. *ita*, cf. *is*, *iste*, *ipse*
  - →Ved. *íti*, cf. *idam*, ...
- PIE \**só-*
  - →Lat. *sic*, cf. *iste*
  - →Gr. ὥς, cf. ὅ, ὅδε
- PIE \**ḱí-*
  - →Hit. *kissan*, cf. *kī*

# Conclusion

- Direct Speech construction
- No quotative particle in the narrow sense
- Two patterns in the speech introduction
  - S – (O) – V
  - V – S
- Optional quotative particle in the wider sense



# Bibliography

- Bauer, Brigitte L. M. 2009. Word Order. In: Baldi, Philip (Hg.). *New Perspectives on Historical Latin Syntax. Volume 1. Syntax of the Sentence*. Berlin: De Gruyter. 241 – 316.
- Beck, Deborah. 2005. *Homeric Conversation*. Cambridge (Massachusetts) & London: Harvard University Press.
- Buchstaller, Isabelle & Ingrid van Alphen. 2012. Introductory remarks on new and old quotatives. In: Buchstaller, Isabelle & Ingrid van Alphen (Hgg.). *Quotatives: cross-linguistic and cross-disciplinary perspectives*. Amsterdam: Benjamins. xi – xxx.
- Coulmas, Florian. 1986. Reported Speech: Some general issues. In: Coulmas, Florian (Hg.). *Direct and Indirect Speech*. Berlin, New York & Amsterdam: Mouton de Gruyter. 1 – 28.
- Debrunner, Albert. 1948. Indirekte Rede im Altindischen. *Acta Orientalia* 20. 120 – 130.
- Delbrück, Berthold. 1888. *Altindische Syntax*. Halle: Waisenhaus.

# Bibliography

- Dunkel, Goerge E. 2014a. *Lexikon der indogermanischen Partikeln und Pronominalstämme. Band 1. Einleitung*. Heidelberg: Universitätsverlag Winter.
- Dunkel, Goerge E. 2014b. *Lexikon der indogermanischen Partikeln und Pronominalstämme. Band 2. Lexikon*. Heidelberg: Universitätsverlag Winter.
- Gather, Andreas. 1994. *Formen referierter Rede*. Frankfurt (Main): Lang.
- Geldner, Karl Friedrich. 1951. *Der Rig-Veda (aus d. Sanskrit ins Dt. übers. u. mit e. laufenden Kommentar versehen)*. Cambridge (Massachusetts): Harvard University Press.
- Hock, Hans Henrich. 1982. The Sanskrit Quotative: A Historical and Comparative Study. *Studies in the Linguistic Sciences* 12/2. 39 – 87.
- Hoffner, Harry A. & H. Craig Melchert. 2008. *A Grammar of the Hittite Language. Part 1: Reference Grammar*. Winona Lake: Eisenbrauns.
- Joseph, Brian D. 1981. Hittite *iwar*, *wa(r)* and Sanskrit *iva*. *Zeitschrift für vergleichende Sprachforschung* 95/1. 93 – 98.

# Bibliography

- Joseph, Brian D. 1982. More on *(i)-wa(r)*. *Zeitschrift für vergleichende Sprachforschung* 96/1. 56 – 58.
- Kaczmarkowski, Michał. 1973. Zu den Arten der reproduzierten Rede und zur Syntax der *oratio recta* in den klassischen lateinischen Prosaschriften. *EOS commentarii societatis philologiae polonorum* LXI. 213 – 238.
- Klein, Jared S. 1991. *Syntactic and Discourse Correlates of Verb-Initial Sentences in the Rigveda*. In: Brereton, Joel P. & Stephanie W. Jamison. *Sense and Syntax in Vedic*. Leiden, New York & Kopenhagen: Brill. 66 – 80.
- Maier, Emar. 2012. Switches between Direct and Indirect Speech in Ancient Greek. *Journal of Greek Linguistics* 12. 118 – 139.
- Mikulova, Jana. 2020. Pragmatic uses of 'I say' in Latin. *Journal of Historical Pragmatics* 22/1. 34 – 68.
- Palmer, Darryl. 2021. *Intermediate Ancient Greek Language*. Acton: ANU Press.
- Pinkster, Harm. 2021. *The Oxford Latin Syntax. Volume II. The complex Sentence and Discourse*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

# Bibliography

Przyluski, Jean. 1934. Sanskrit *iva*, hittite *iwar*. *Revue Hittite et Asianique* 3. 225 – 226.

von Roncador, Manfred. 1988. *Zwischen direkter und indirekter Rede. Nichtwörtliche direkte Rede, erlebte Rede, logophorische Konstruktionen und Verwandtes*. Berlin & Boston: De Gruyter.

Schadewaldt, Wolfgang. 2016 (1975). *Homer. Ilias*. Berlin: Insel.

Schadewaldt, Wolfgang. 2017 (1958). *Homer. Die Odyssee*. Reinbeck: Rowohlt.

Tischler, Johann. 2016. *Hethitisches Etymologisches Glossar. Teil IV, Lieferung 16. W – Z*. Innsbruck: Inst. für Sprachen und u. Literaturen der Univ.

Viti, Carlotta. 2015. *Variation und Wandel in der Syntax der alten indogermanischen Sprachen*. Tübingen: Narr.

Watkins, Calvert. 1995. *How to kill a dragon*. New York: Oxford University Press.

# Latin

- ***Vbi abit conclamo: heus quid agis tu inquam in tegulis?***  
'Since he jumps away, I shout: "Hey, what are you doing", I say, "on the roof?"'  
Pl. Mil. gl. 178
- ***Fuit autem rogatio talis: velitis iubeatis quirites [...]***  
'The proposal however has been made in such a way: "Is it your order and wish, citizens, [...]"'  
Liv. 38.54.3
- ***Sic hoc respondit mihi: ego pol Sauream non novi neque qua facie sit scio.***  
'So he responded this to me: "I don't know Saurea, nor do I know how he looks."  
Pl. As. 352 – 353
- ***Ita fertur interrogasse: certe patrem tuum non occidisti?***  
'He is said to have asked thus: "Surely you didn't kill your father, didn't you?"'  
Suet. Aug. 33.1

# Ancient Greek

- **καὶ οἱ μὲν Κερκυραῖοι ἔλεξαν τοιάδε. Δίκαιον ὦ Ἀθηναῖοι [...]. τοιαῦτα μὲν οἱ Κερκυραῖοι εἶπον.**

'And the Cercyreans spoke such: "[It is only] just, o Athenians [...]"  
such the Cercyreans spoke.' Th. 1.31.4 – 1.32.1, 1.36.4

- **τὸν δ' ἀπαμειβόμενος προσέφη πόδας ὠκὺς Ἀχιλλεύς:  
θαρσήσας [...]**

'Then the swift-footed Achilles answered and spoke to him: "Take  
heart! [...]"' Il. 1.84 – 1.85

- **[...]. ὥς ἔφατ' Ἀντίνοος, τοῖσιν δ' ἐπιήνδανε μῦθος.**

“[...]”. Thus Antinoos spoke and they took pleasure in the speech.'

Od. 21.143

## Vedic Sanskrit

- PSQ:** *íti bravīti vaktārī rārāṇaḥ* / vásor vasutvá kārāvo 'nehāḥ  
 'He speaks thus, while bestowing (gifts) at the speaking: "Through the goodness of the good one, the bards are blameless." X.61.12
- QPS:** *yá índrāya sunávāméty āha*  
 "'Let us press (soma) for Indra.", thus he says.' V.37.1
- SQP:** *nákir vaktā ná dād íti*  
 'No one can say: "He does not give."' VIII.32.15
- SQ:** *agnír jāgāra tám ayám sóma āha* / távāhám asmi sakhyé nyòkāḥ  
 'Agni stays awake: to him does this Soma say: "I am at home in fellowship with you."' V.44.15

# Hittite

- **[nu] kisan memai kās=wa=mu URU-as kapilallis ēsta**

‘Thus he speaks: “This town has been hostile to me!”’

KUB 7.60 Ov. iii 11 – 12

- **nu=tta mān DINGIR<sup>MEŠ</sup> kissan punussanzi kī=wa kuit iēsser.**

‘If the gods ask you thus: “Why did they do this?”’

KBo 17.105 Ov. ii 17 – 18

- **nu sarā nepisi atti=ssi halzāis ammugg=a EGIR -pa anda ēp**

‘He shouted towards heaven to his father “Take me as well!”’

KBo 3.7 Rv. iii 27 – 29